

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
DALLAS DIVISION**

VALTRUS INNOVATIONS LTD.,  
KEY PATENT INNOVATIONS LTD.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

GOOGLE LLC,

Defendant.

**Case No. 3:24-cv-1795-S**

**JURY TRIAL DEMANDED**

**PLAINTIFFS VALTRUS INNOVATIONS LTD. AND KEY PATENT INNOVATIONS  
LIMITED'S RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT GOOGLE LLC'S MOTION TO EXTEND  
TIME**

This motion should have never been filed as opposed. Below is a verbatim excerpt of Valtrus' position in response to Google when Google asked for an extension:

As to your request for an extension on the response to the motions to consolidate in Valtrus I and II, and Valtrus' Motion to Amend the Complaint in Valtrus I, Valtrus is willing to not oppose an extension from January 8th to January 22nd so long as Google agrees not to use the agreement as a basis to delay the status conference on January 8th in Valtrus II and Google agrees to a similar courtesy the next time it files a motion.

Ex. 1 at Appx. 1. Google's inability to agree to common courtesy in this case is mystifying.

This case ("*Valtrus II*") is a counter-part to a case that has been pending in the District for three years ("*Valtrus I*," Case No. 22-0066-L). In order to include Valtrus' parent KPI in the case to address any standing issues while *Valtrus I* was stayed, Valtrus filed a second case involving the same patents but including Valtrus' parent as a plaintiff. *Valtrus I* was recently re-assigned to Judge Lindsay after Chief Judge Godbey granted Valtrus' opposed motion to lift the stay in that case based on the Patent Trial and Appeals Board's rejection of Google's invalidity challenges on fundamental patents created by Hewlett Packard Enterprises' ("HPE") predecessors that read on Google's core search and cloud business. *See Valtrus I*, Dkt. No. 203. Valtrus is a successor to a substantial portion of HPE's patent portfolio. After HPE's predecessors created these patents, Google poached the inventors to build its search and cloud business. The following past or current Google engineers and executives are named inventors on the patents in suit: Prabhakar Raghavan (Chief Technologist), Krishna A. Bharat (Distinguished Research Scientist), George A. Mihaila (Senior Software Engineer, fmr.), Rajat Mukherjee (Group Product Manager, fmr.), Jianchang Mao (Vice President, fmr.).

After three years in this District and shortly after assignment of *Valtrus II* to this Court and *Valtrus I* to Judge Lindsay, Google has announced that it wants out and intends to file a raft of motions to stay and transfer. *See Valtrus I*, Dkt. No. 210 at 13, 16.

Google's only basis for objecting to Valtrus' request for reciprocal courtesy is to certify that the next motions it intends to bring are "unknown" and will be "brought at unknown times and under unknown circumstances." *Valtrus I*, Dkt. No. 211 at 6. ***This makes no sense***; Google already stated that it was going to bring motions to stay and transfer, in an attempt to add months if not years to this case. *Valtrus I*, Dkt. No. 210 at 13, 16.

Valtrus does not fundamentally oppose an extension of the sort requested and advised Google as much. However, when faced with a simple request of reciprocity and/or courtesy on future motions, Google chose to bring this dispute before the Court unnecessarily.

Dated: December 26, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Greg Love

Greg Love (SBN 24013060)  
**STECKLER WAYNE & LOVE PLLC**  
107 E Main Street  
Henderson, Texas 75652  
Telephone: (903) 212-4444  
E-mail: [greg@stecklerlaw.com](mailto:greg@stecklerlaw.com)

Hon. Paul D. Stickney (Ret.) (SBN 00789924)  
**STECKLER WAYNE & LOVE PLLC**  
12720 Hillcrest Road, Suite 1045  
Dallas, Texas 75230  
Telephone: (972) 387-4040  
E-mail: [judgestickney@stecklerlaw.com](mailto:judgestickney@stecklerlaw.com)

Jason Sheasby (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Amy E. Proctor (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Connor He-Schaefer (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
**IRELL & MANELLA LLP**  
1800 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 900  
Los Angeles, California 90067  
Telephone: (310) 277-1010  
E-mail: [jsheasby@irell.com](mailto:jsheasby@irell.com)  
E-mail: [aproctor@irell.com](mailto:aproctor@irell.com)  
E-mail: [che-schaefer@irell.com](mailto:che-schaefer@irell.com)

**COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This is to certify that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served with a copy of this document via the Court's CM/ECF system on December 26, 2024.

/s/ Greg Love